

Monitoring Report: Treatment of The Traveling Public (Policy 2.1)

Finance Committee Meeting Review Date: October 31st 2023

Board of Directors Meeting Review Date: November 16th 2023

INFORMATION TYPE
Monitoring
RECOMMENDED ACTION(S)
<p>That the Board review this monitoring report and consider accepting it as:</p> <p>(A) a reasonable interpretation for all policy items and that the evidence demonstrates compliance with the interpretations.</p> <p>(B) a reasonable interpretation for all policy items and that the evidence demonstrates compliance with the interpretations, except for the CEO’s stated non-compliance with item(s) x .x, which the Board acknowledges and accepts the proposed dates for compliance.is making reasonable progress towards compliance.</p> <p>(C) 1. For policy items x.x.x – there is evidence of compliance with a reasonable interpretation 2. For policy items x.x.x – the interpretation is not reasonable 3. For policy items x.x.x – the interpretation is reasonable, but the evidence does not demonstrate compliance 4. For policy items x.x.x – the Board acknowledges and accepts the CEO’s stated non-compliance and the proposed dates for compliance</p>
PRIOR RELEVANT BOARD ACTIONS & POLICIES
<p>Monitoring Reports are a key Policy Governance tool to assess organizational/CEO performance in achieving Ends (1.0) within Executive Limitations (2.0). A Policy-Governance-consistent Monitoring Process is:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. CEO sends Monitoring Report to all board members 2. At Board meeting, board accepts Monitoring Report through majority vote (or if not acceptable, determines next steps)

ISSUE SUMMARY

TheRide’s Board of Directors establish policies that define what methods are unacceptable to use to achieve expected results, called Executive Limitations. This monitoring report provides the CEO’s interpretations of those policies, evidence of achievement, and an assertion on compliance with the Board’s written goals. As with other monitoring reports, the Board decides whether the interpretations are reasonable, and the evidence is convincing.

Per Appendix A of the Board Policy Manual, this report was scheduled for monitoring in November and was submitted in November.

I certify that the information is true and complete, and I request that the Board accept this as indicating an acceptable level of compliance.

CEO’s Signature



Date

October 16, 2023

ATTACHMENTS

1. Monitoring report for Treatment of the Traveling Public (Policy 2.1)

Table of Contents

POLICY TITLE: TREATMENT OF THE TRAVELING PUBLIC	Page#	Compliance
2.1 With respect to the agency’s operations and interactions with riders, potential riders, pedestrians, cyclists, other road users, and the general public the CEO shall not cause, allow or fail to address conditions, procedures, or decisions that are unsafe, undignified, disrespectful, unclear, or overly intrusive. Further, without limiting the scope of the foregoing by this enumeration, the CEO shall not:	4	
2.1.1. Allow facilities, bus stops, vehicles, or services to lack reasonable accessibility for potential riders regardless of mobility limitations.	5	
2.1.2 Operate without providing effective, comprehensible, accessible, and timely information.	6	
2.1.2.1 Permit unfair, inconsistent, or untimely responses to questions or complaints from the traveling public.	8	
2.1.3 Operate without established and enforceable standards for customer service and the safety of the public including pedestrians, cyclists and other road users.	9	
2.1.3.1 Allow the public and riders to be without easily accessible, understandable information with respect to services offered and expected conduct.	10	
2.1.4 Use methods of collecting, reviewing, transmitting, or storing personal information that allows improper access or inappropriate disclosure.	11	
2.1.4.1 Use forms that elicit personal information for which there is no clear necessity.	12	

 Fully Compliant
  Partially Compliant
  Non-Compliant

Preliminary CEO Interpretations and Evidence

POLICY 2.1

With respect to the agency’s operations and interactions with riders, potential riders, pedestrians, cyclists, other road users, and the general public the CEO shall not cause, allow or fail to address conditions, procedures, or decisions that are unsafe, undignified, disrespectful, unclear, or overly intrusive. Further, without limiting the scope of the foregoing by this enumeration, the CEO shall not:

Degree of Compliance: Compliant

Interpretation

Measure/Standards & Achievement

Compliance with this policy will be demonstrated when all lower policies are compliant.

Rationale

The Board has fully defined its intent in lower-level policies

Evidence

Source of Data: Lower-level policies

Date of Data Review: 10/09/23 as verified by Corporate Strategy & Performance Officer.

Data:

All lower-level policies are compliant

POLICY 2.1.1

Allow facilities, bus stops, vehicles, or services to lack reasonable accessibility for potential riders regardless of mobility limitations.

Degree of Compliance: Compliant

Interpretation

Measure/Standards & Achievement

Compliance with this policy will be demonstrated when all aspects of TheRide’s operations, buses, bus stops, and facilities, comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) requirements for accessibility or a plan is in place to reach compliance. Specifically, this means that while in operation:

- A. All fixed-route buses are wheelchair accessible with functioning ramps or lifts and appropriate tie-down equipment,
- B. All fixed-route buses have functional visual and auditory stop announcements,
- C. All contracted service vehicles are wheelchair accessible,
- D. All buildings, park n ride lots and other general structures are already wheelchair accessible, and
- E. Financial and staff resources are available to ensure that all bus stops near sidewalks are made wheelchair accessible by 2033.

Rationale

This is reasonable because

- A-D. These measures address all elements necessary for passengers to be able to use transit services, are within the AAATA’s financial resources to afford, and align with legal accessibility requirements found in the ADA which can be objectively determined by an outside authority (FTA) and have become an industry standard. For contracted services, the start and stop points are predetermined and hence no audio, visual stop announcements are necessary.

Note: This policy interpretation addresses only in-service operations. It is reasonable to expect that when out of service accessibility requirements may not always be met e.g., a bus with a failed ramp in the maintenance shop.

- E. Financial and staff resources are within the agency’s ability to control. Additionally, only bus stops near sidewalks can be made wheelchair accessible.

Evidence

Source of Data: Operational and planning records

Date of Data Review: as noted below

Data: During the monitoring period:

- A. 100% of buses were wheelchair accessible with ramps or lifts, wheelchair spaces, and appropriate tie-down equipment. An inspection of maintenance procedures and records indicate that ramps, lifts, and ties downs were functional before a bus was put into or returned to public service. Verified by Manager of Fleet 10/04/2023
- B. An inspection of fleet inventory records confirms that all fixed-route buses had auditory announcements and visual signs indicating stops which were functional during the monitoring period. Verified by Manager of Fleet 10/04/2023

- C. An inspection of all facilities (i.e., two bus terminals, two park n ride lots, and one office building) confirmed that all buildings were accessible to wheelchairs. All buildings had automatic doors which were functional or repaired promptly. Verified by Manager of Facilities 10/04/2023
- D. A review of our contracted services -A-Ride, GoldRide and FlexRide confirm that all vehicles in service were wheel chair accessible. Verified by Manager of Mobility Services 10/04/2023.
- E. A review of the FY23 Budget confirms that there were funds dedicated to the construction of bus stop bus pads and lead walks. During the monitoring period, 9 bus stops near sidewalks were made accessible. This is in line with our plan to make all bus stops near sidewalks accessible by 2033 (Policy 1.1.2 compliance timeline). Verified by the DCEO, Planning And Innovation 10/04/2023.

POLICY 2.1.2
Operate without providing effective, comprehensible, accessible, and timely information.

Degree of Compliance: Compliant

Interpretation

Measure/Standards & Achievement
Compliance with this policy will be demonstrated by

- A. Compliance of policy 2.1.2.1
- B. Availability of accurate information on how to use our services (i.e., fixed-route time tables and maps, paratransit information, staff contact information) and general information about the agency is available prior to travel.
 - a) **Printed Material:** Printed RideGuides available in English, Spanish, Arabic, and Mandarin (per federal requirements).
 - b) **On-Line:** TheRide’s website with features allowing use for persons with sight limitations and in non-English languages.
 - c) **Real-Time Information:** Available on TheRide’s website and as a live feed for use in third-party apps
 - d) **Personal Responses:** Staff are available by phone or at the terminal during regular business hours.

Rationale
The interpretations are reasonable because

- A. Compliance with this policy constitutes compliance with lower-level policies.
- B. The types of information provided can be measured, are within the control of the agency, address federal requirements for information stemming from the ADA and Title VI, are affordable given the resources available, and respond to the vast majority of public needs for trip planning or special accommodation.

Evidence

Source of Data: Community relations documents
Date of Data Review: 10/03/23 as verified by Interim Manager of Community Relations
Data:

- A. Policy 2.1.2.1 is compliant
- B. Evidence of availability and quality of information is provided below.

	Available throughout the monitoring period? Y/N
a) Printed Material	Y
b) On-line material	Y
c) Real-time information	Y

d) Verified by the Manager of Mobility Services (10/04/2023), staff were available throughout the monitoring period as follows:

	Phone services available through the times provided during the monitoring period? Y/N
Phone availability from 6:30AM to 10:00PM Monday thru Friday	Y
In person availability: Blake Transit Center to answer questions from 7:00AM to 7:00PM on weekdays 8:00AM-5:45PM on weekends.	Y

POLICY 2.1.2.1

Permit unfair, inconsistent, or untimely responses to questions or complaints from the traveling public.

Degree of Compliance: Compliant

Interpretation

Measure/Standards & Achievement

Compliance with this policy will be demonstrated when:

- A. Acknowledgement:
 - i. All written inquiries and concerns received through the customer service customer website are acknowledged within 2 business days
 - ii. All phone calls entered in the customer concern tracking database are acknowledged the same day.
- B. Waiting times:
 - i. Waiting time for responses to general phone inquiries about how to use AAATA services during business hours is less than 2 minutes.
- C. Resolution: Open cases are reviewed, solved and closed within the following timelines:
 - i. 90% of inquiries and concerns are resolved within 10 business days
 - ii. 99% of inquiries and concerns are resolved within 20 business days.

Rationale

These standards are reasonable because they provide a consistent way of addressing most concerns in a timely fashion. These timelines are also within the limits of resources available. is impractical to track in-field verbal communications and

Evidence

Source of Data: Internal Documents

Date of Data Review: 10/04/2023 as verified by Manager of Mobility Services and Customer Service Officer

Data:

	Target	Average time taken during the monitoring period	Target achieved? Y/N
A. Acknowledgment of			
i. written inquiries and concerns	2 days	1 day	Y
ii. phone calls	Same day	Same day	Y
B. Wait time of phone calls on general inquiries	2 minutes	45 seconds	Y
C. i. Resolving of 90% of inquiries	10 business days	10 business days	Y
ii. Resolving of 99% of inquiries	20 business days	20 business days	Y

POLICY 2.1.3
Operate without established and enforceable standards for customer service and the safety of the public including pedestrians, cyclists and other road users.
Degree of Compliance: Compliant
Interpretation
<p><u>Measure/Standards & Achievement</u> Compliance with this policy will be achieved when</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Policy 2.1.3.1 below is compliant B. 100% of all front-line staff have received customer service and safety training. C. Manager of operations confirms that corrective and reinforcement actions were in place and applied throughout the monitoring period. <p><u>Rationale</u> This interpretation is reasonable because</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Compliance with this policy constitutes compliance with lower-level policies. B. Customer service and safety training for front line staff (i.e., bus drivers, mechanics, call takers and contracted drivers) includes, proper vehicle maintenance, safe operation of the vehicle(to include consideration of other roads users), relevant laws, etc., as applicable to the role. Detailed operational performance and customers satisfaction are addressed further under policy 1.4 and Quarterly Service Reports. This section of the policy addresses the <i>availability of standards</i> (through training), and part C (below) addresses the enforcement of set standards/expectations. C. Confirmation of corrective and reinforcement actions in relation to safety and customer service expectations indicates enforcement of such standards. <p>Note: an increase or decrease in action does not equate to proof that standards were enforced in some cases more than others but the fact that there were instances of enforcement.</p>
Evidence
<p>Source of Data: Operational documents Date of Data Review: 10/09/2023 as verified by the Manager of Operations. Data:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A. Policy 2.1.3.1 is compliant B. 100% of all front-line staff received customer service and safety training C. There were a total of 92 positive reinforcement or corrective actions in relation to safety and customer service.

POLICY 2.1.3.1

Allow the public and riders to be without easily accessible, understandable information with respect to services offered and expected conduct.

Degree of Compliance: Compliant

Interpretation

Measure/Standards & Achievement

Compliance with this policy will be demonstrated when TheRide publishes a code of conduct or riding rules and policies in all buses, terminals, website and the printed RideGuide.

Rationale

This is reasonable because the code of conduct or riding rules and policies outline expectations for public behavior on agency property and in buses. Publishing written material in transit centers, on all buses, in the Ride Guide, and on the website is reasonable as those are the areas that the public can readily access/see them.

Additionally, Policy 2.1.2 has addressed information in respect to the services offered. To avoid repetition this interpretation addresses public conduct only.

Evidence

Source of Data: Code of conduct, riding rules and policy postings

Date of Data Review: 10/03/23 as verified by Manager of Facilities and the interim Manager of Community Relations

Data:

The code of conduct was posted in buses, terminals, and on the website. The RideGuides had riding rules and policies.

POLICY 2.1.4

Use methods of collecting, reviewing, transmitting, or storing personal information that allows improper access or inappropriate disclosure

Degree of Compliance: Compliant

Interpretation

Measure/Standards & Achievement

Compliance with this policy will be achieved when

- A. Policy 2.1.4.1 below is compliant
- B. Sensitive personal information collected through the paratransit program (ARide) is handled in accordance with the Confidentiality of Applicant Information provisions of the Americans with Disabilities Act.

Rationale

This is reasonable because

- A. Compliance with this policy constitutes compliance with lower-level policies.
- B. Customer personal information is collected for the paratransit (ARIDE) program only. (GoldRide, and the Fare Deal program users may need to verify demographic information, but their information is not collected or stored by the agency.) A-Ride is operated in line with the America with Disabilities Act (ADA) which provides guidelines on how to keep such information confidential and only accessible/disclosed to appropriate persons for the right reasons. Compliance with ADA requirements is reviewed during the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) tri-annual review.

Evidence

Source of Data: Operational records

Date of Data Review: 10/4/2023 as verified by Manager of Mobility Services

Data:

- A. Policy 2.1.4.1 is compliant
- B. During the monitoring period customer information was secured in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act confidentiality requirements

POLICY 2.1.4.1

Use forms that elicit personal information for which there is no clear necessity.

Degree of Compliance: Compliant

Interpretation

Measure/Standards & Achievement

Compliance with this policy will be demonstrated when

- A. No written or electronic means is used to collect information unless the agency is legally required to, it is necessary to effectively administer programs such as paratransit or it is needed for safety and security reasons.
- B. The Deputy CEO of Finance and Administration approves any new form requesting personal information from a member of the public

Rationale

Policy 2.1.4 addresses collecting and handling of customer information. To avoid repetition, this policy interpretation focuses on *establishing the need* to collect personal information for existing and future forms. Requiring that the Deputy CEO of Finance and Administration approve new forms places a guard that reviews and validates the necessity of any such form that would be used in the future.

Evidence

Source of Data: Customer data systems

Date of Data Review: 10/4/2023 as verified by DCEO, Finance and Administration.

Data:

- A. Existing written and electronic means of collecting customer information have already been approved as necessary to conduct business operations.
- B. No new forms requesting personal information were developed or approved in the monitoring period.

Policy Trendlines

Policy	FY 22	FY 23	FY24
2.1	Yellow	Yellow	Green
2.1.1	Yellow	Yellow	Green
2.1.2	Green	Green	Green
2.1.2.1	White	White	Green
2.1.3	Yellow	Yellow	Green
2.1.3.1	Yellow	Green	Green
2.1.4	Green	Green	Green
2.1.4.1	White	White	Green
2.1.5	Yellow	Green	White
2.1.5.1	Green	Green	White
2.1.6	Green	Green	White
2.1.6.1	Green	Green	White

LEGEND	
Green	Policy is compliant
Yellow	Policy is partially compliant
Red	Policy is not compliant
White	Policy is deleted or previously inexistent.

Guidance on Determining “Reasonableness” of CEO Interpretations

Are the interpretations reasonable?

An interpretation is reasonable if the following are provided,

1. a measure or standard,
2. a defensible rationale for the measure or standard,
3. a level of achievement necessary to achieve compliance and
4. a rationale for the level of achievement.

Is evidence verifiable?

Evidence is verifiable if there is

1. actual measurement/data,
2. the source of data and
3. the date when data was collected is provided.

CEO Notes: (If Applicable)

Board's Conclusion on Monitoring Report

Board's conclusion after monitoring the report.

Following the Board's review and discussion with the CEO, the Board finds that the CEO:

- (A) a reasonable interpretation for **all** policy items and that the evidence demonstrates compliance with the interpretations.
- (B) a reasonable interpretation for all policy items and that the evidence demonstrates compliance with the interpretations, except for the CEO's stated non-compliance with item(s) x .x, which the Board acknowledges and accepts the proposed dates for compliance.is making reasonable progress towards compliance.
- (C)
 1. For policy items x.x.x – there is evidence of compliance with a reasonable interpretation
 2. For policy items x.x.x – the interpretation is not reasonable
 3. For policy items x.x.x – the interpretation is reasonable, but the evidence does not demonstrate compliance
 4. For policy items x.x.x – the Board acknowledges and accepts the CEO's stated non-compliance and the proposed dates for compliance

Board Notes: (If Applicable)

The Board accepted the monitoring report for Treatment of the Traveling Public (2.1) as (A) Compliant.