## Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors

## **Meeting Minutes**

# Thursday, August 16, 2018

## 6:30 p.m.

# Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan

Present: Eric Mahler, Mike Allemang, Eli Cooper, Gillian Ream Gainsley, Prashanth Gururaja, Larry Krieg, Kyra Sims

Chairman Eric Mahler called the meeting to order at 6:33 p.m.

## 1) Opening Items

1. Approve Agenda

At 6:33 p.m., a motion was made by Mr. Cooper to approve the agenda, seconded by Dr. Krieg. On a unanimous vote, Chairman Mahler declared the motion adopted. No dissenting. Chairman Mahler stated that a Quorum was present.

## 1. Public Comment

Jim Moegensen recalled the original AAATA interest in the Y—Lot which was at a time when money was needed to build a new one. The City now has the money to cover what they paid for the lot. He also noted that bus zone fares won't work because of institutionalized racism in Washtenaw County and not meeting Title VI.

## 2. General Announcements

- Chairman Mahler commented he was proud of the Millage election which did very well with 83% of the vote, expressed appreciation for the voters who supported it, stated that this was a mandate to keep up what is being done, do more and thanked the donors and those that worked to raise the money including Mr. Allemang, Mike Garfield, Mr. Hewitt, Mr. Carpenter. Other Board Members and Mr. Carpenter made similar comments.
- 2. Chairman Mahler announced that this is the last meeting for their esteemed colleague Gillian Ream Gainsley and invited her to join him at the podium. He noted that she was the first representative from Ypsilanti, joining the Board in 2013, was an advocate across jurisdictions, had held several positions including Recording Secretary and member of the Governance Committee, setting a high standard to be followed. Ms. Gainsley then spoke of her appreciation for the last 5 years, that she had learned a lot and was talking to others to encourage them to join the Board. She was presented with "The Ride" Mailbox.
- 3. Mr. Carpenter announced that it was sadly the last meeting for Forest Yang. Although he had only been here for a year it has been very fruitful, especially internally and will serve us well into the future. Mr. Yang spoke indicating that he had learned a lot, he admires the

dedication of the Board, the community support shows appreciation and that the Board and staff has the best intent for the best community service.

- 4. Chairman Mahler asked if there were other announcements. There were not.
- 2) Policy Monitoring and Development
  - 1. Board's Annual Plan of Work

Chairman Mahler stated that after the Board retreat, the 3 task forces had become lax. The task force leaders should start again so as not to lose the momentum from the retreat.

- 2. Policy Monitoring and Committee Reports
  - 1. Governance Committee

Chairman Mahler announced that next month are officer elections, there are empty Board seats to be filled and there is the CEO Evaluation. The Committee agreed that the Millage effort was well done.

2. Finance Committee

Mr. Allemang reported that the agenda included a Millage debrief, a look at the Strategic Business Plan, Monitoring Report 2.4, a draft of Planning and Budgeting. They were impressed with the Strategic Business Plan and the Budget, as well as with the results for the Quarter 3 Financial Report.

3. Service Committee

Ms. Gainsley reported that there was an election debrief, a review of the Monitoring Report about CEO Succession, the Strategic Business Plan was discussed, the YTC Planning Report went public today and sites will soon be displayed at the center. She commented this is a great opportunity for public input.

- 3. Other Board Reports & Ownership Linkages
  - 1. LAC, WATS, A2 Transportation Commission
    - a. Local Advisory Council: Kathleen Mozak-Betts read a report on behalf of the Local Advisory Council (LAC), particularly: that there is no service on Labor Day, that there is an opening for an Executive Committee member with another one coming up, that there was an update on Air Ridge Para Transit Study by Bill DeGroot.
    - b. Washentaw Area Transportation Study: Dr. Krieg reported that there was no meeting because they lacked an agenda. He highlighted some projects that are under discussion including ReImagine Washtenaw. Discussion and questions followed.
    - c. A2 Transportation Commission

Ms. Sims didn't attend last night so Mr. Cooper gave the report. There was a full agenda and he gave specifics on a variety of projects. Chairman Mahler requested a copy of the Transportation Commission Report for the Board.

- 3) Strategy and Operational Updates: CEO
  - 1. Draft Strategic Business Plan

Mr. Carpenter reported on the beginning of rolling out the Strategic Business Plan and the Budget with added information from the public, in particular: The Strategic Business Plan is the transition between the Board's expectations (Ends) and the implementation of them in an annual cycle that is revisited each year. It is a new tool that enables feedback and transparency.

Mr. Carpenter reviewed the details of how the Board's goals would be reached based upon prioritized projects. In particular, he highlighted expansion vs. maintenance/keeping things in a "state of good repair". He requested feedback from the Board and the public and provided venues for this so that the document could then be tweaked. He reviewed details of specific priorities and how they were selected. He noted that one member of the public asked the interesting question, "what keeps you up at night"?

2. Draft 2019 Budget

Mr. Metzinger reviewed the Budget, in particular; forecasting growth in 2019, highlighting major projects as they fit in with the balanced budget requirement, Operating Budget details including "state of good repair", the 2019 Capital Budget. There were questions from the Board to which he responded that he will bring more detail with the next revision of the report, while other questions led to discussion. Dr. Krieg noted that the public should understand that the Board sets the goals on behalf of the community and will listen to it. Mr. Cooper and Mr. Allemang congratulated Mr. Carpenter and the Executive and Management Teams for the high quality of the reports. Mr. Cooper commented in reference to the "state of good repair", that it is important to protect our assets which include our people and our facility.

3. Q3 Financial Report

Mr. Metzinger reviewed the details of the report highlighting what the reserve will cover, the beginning of 2019 and detailed investments. He answered questions by the Board on topics including quarterly revenue and the balance sheet.

## 4. Q3 Service Report

Mr. Smith reported an 85% on time performance and explained how that number was gotten. Mr. Carpenter added additional context and answered a question about what level of incident gets reported to the Board. Mr. Smith commented that the Strategic Business Plan is a contract with the public which he feels is a personal obligation. Mr. Cooper stated that he disliked an on time performance below 80% and it's important to know why. This was discussed.

## 5. CEO Report

The report was received. There was no discussion.

- 4) Board Development
  - 1. Chairman Mahler asked if there was anything. There was nothing.
- 5) Emergent Business + Budget Public Hearing
  - 1. Budget Public Hearing

Mr. Cooper made a motion to suspend the regular meeting to have the Public Hearing. Ms. Sims seconded the motion. Chairman Mahler took an all hands vote. It was unanimous.

Jim Moegensen of Ann Arbor thanked the Board and Staff for the Strategic Business Plan and the Budget. He stated the state function was difficult to figure out and without Chris White, he didn't know that Air Ride qualified for state funding. He stated that the fares are complicated but that the Strategic Business Plan and the Budget were very helpful. He compared AAATA to the U of M transportation noting they do not have the same general population, in particular AAATA, including ParaTransit, transports the low income, young people and seniors. He would like to see more budget details. He has some early POSA Agreements and thinks they would be helpful maybe as an Appendix to help people understand how they work. Chairman Mahler thanked him for his comments and stated they will be taken under advisement.

Michelle Barney, Chidster Place, Ypsilanti, stated she was glad the Millage won, that she got involved with groups to support it before the election, that she will develop more contacts for additional millages, things that were mailed helped her speak about the Millage and she complimented Mr. Carpenter and the Board on their work. She noted that papers sent by AAATA in the mail were helpful for her to present with. She also commented that at her bus stop, the drivers often don't see passengers waiting on the other side of the street and that perhaps drivers are more worried about time than looking for passengers which is not so good. Chairman Mahler thanked her for her comments and stated they will be taken under advisement. Chairman Mahler suggested returning to the regular agenda. Mr. Cooper made a motion to do so. Ms. Gainsley seconded. An all hands vote was unanimous.

#### 6) Closing Items

- Topics for Next Meeting: Budget approval, officer elections, 2.4, 2.9 Report, Plan of Work, CEO Evaluation which will not be public, LAC appointment, minutes. Chairman Mahler asked for more comments. Dr. Krieg expressed disappointment at not having Board Education and recommended Mr. Ed Benning of Genesee County Transit as good regarding problem solving. Mr. Allemang commented that the next Board Meeting will also include reviewing Policy 2.4 Planning and Budget.
- 2. Chairman Mahler commented that the meeting was running over time for the room reservation but that it was a good meeting.
- 3. Adjournment

Dr. Krieg moved to adjourn with support from Ms. Sims. The motion carried, and the meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m. by unanimous vote.

Respectfully submitted by Geri Barnstable