

---

**ANN ARBOR AREA TRANSPORTATION AUTHORITY BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

DATE: Thursday, October 18, 2018

TIME: 6:30pm – 9:00pm

PLACE: Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor MI 48104

MEETING CHAIR: Eric Mahler

**AGENDA**

<b>1) Opening Items</b>	<b>Detail</b>
1. Approve Agenda	
2. Public Comment	
3. General Announcements	
1. Introduce General Counsel: Dykema	Mel Muskovitz
<b>2) Consent Agenda</b>	
1. Minutes	
2. Updated Schedule for Monitoring Reports	
<b>3) Board Development</b>	
1. Board Education: New Mobility Technology	Dr. Johnathan Levine
<b>4) Policy Monitoring and Development</b>	
1. Board's Annual Plan of Work Item	
1. Annual Plan of Work + Education	Mahler
2. Policy Monitoring and Committee Reports	
1. Governance Committee	Mahler
2. Finance Committee	Allemang
3. Service Committee	Hewitt
a. Policy Update: 2.1 Treatment of Riders	
3. Other Board Reports & Ownership Linkages	
1. LAC, WATS, A2 Transportation Commission	Krieg, Sims
<b>5) Strategy and Operational Updates: CEO</b>	Carpenter
1. CEO Report	
<b>6) Emergent Business</b>	
<b>7) Closing Items</b>	
1. Topics for Next Meeting: Quarter 4 Reports, Year End Report, Monitoring Report 2.1 Treatment of Staff	<i>Thursday, November 15, 2018 @ 6:30pm</i>
2. Public Comment	
3. Board Assessment of Meeting	
4. Adjournment	

K:\Administration\readonly\Board of Directors\2018 Meetings\Agendas

## Monitoring Reports

### **Sample Motions**

**Accepting:** I move that:

- We affirm that Monitoring Report XYZ has been read by board members, and
- We accept this report as it provides
  - a reasonable interpretation of the policy and
  - evidence of compliance with that reasonable interpretation [or... while not in compliance, shows evidence of reasonable progress/commitment toward compliance]

**Not Accepting:** I move that:

- We affirm that Monitoring Report XYZ has been read by board members, and
- We do not accept this report
  - as the interpretation for XYZ.XYZ cannot be deemed reasonable by a rational person
  - A. OR
  - though it provides a reasonable interpretation, it does not adequately provide evidence of compliance for XYZ.XYZ.
- CEO will provide an updated Monitoring Report XYZ within ## months.

### ***If additional policy development is desired:***

Discuss in Board Agenda Item 3.0 Policy Monitoring and Development. It may be appropriate to assign a committee or task force to develop policy language options for board to consider at a later date.

## Emergent Topics

Policy 3.13 places an emphasis on distinguishing Board and Staff roles, with the Board focusing on “long term impacts outside the organization, not on the administrative or programmatic means of attaining those effects.” Policy 3.1.3.1 specifies that that Board use a structured conversation before addressing a topic, to ensure that the discussion is appropriately framed:

1. What is the nature of the issue? Is the issue within the scope of the agency?
  2. What is the value [principle] that drives the concern?
  3. Whose issue is this? Is it the Board’s [Policy, 3.0 and 4.0] or the CEO’s [running the organization, 1.0 and 2.0]?
  4. Is there already a Board policy that adequately covers the issue? If so, what has the Board already said on this subject and how is this issue related? Does the Board wish to change what it has already said?
-

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors

Meeting Minutes

Thursday, September 20, 2018

6:30 p.m.

Ann Arbor District Library, 343 South Fifth Avenue, Ann Arbor, Michigan

Present: Eric Mahler (Chair), Eli Cooper, Roger Hewitt, Prashanth Gururaja, Larry Krieg, Kyra Sims, Kathleen Mozak-Betts, Jesse Miller

Chairman Eric Mahler called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

1) Opening Items

1. Approve Agenda

Chairman Mahler asked that the Agenda be moved into the record. Mr. Hewitt made a motion to do so with Ms. Sims seconding. The Chairman added under 6a., Resolution 11 for the CEO Evaluation.

At 6:33 p.m., a motion was made by Mr. Cooper to approve the agenda, seconded by Dr. Krieg. On a unanimous vote, Chairman Mahler declared the motion adopted.

1. Public Comment

Ken Clark, a cyclist, spoke about Executive Limitations. He lives on Plymouth Road and bikes everywhere except in the winter when he takes the bus. He is concerned about how buses interact with cyclists. He provided details of a specific incident. He reported it to our website with no response and when he called, the person he spoke to did not get back to him as promised. He says he has made many complaints over the years. There are Executive Limitations to deal with riders and staff but nothing for the general public. He proposed the Board consider a policy for that.

Jim Moegensen observed that the updated website is not so easy to use.

2. General Announcements

1. Chairman Mahler announced that there are 2 new Board Members, Kathleen Mozak-Betts and Jesse Miller. Ms. Mozak-Betts is known to the Board from providing the LAC reports. She stated that she is an avid bus rider, looks forward to serving for the next 5 years, and hopes to lend a different voice to the Board. Mr. Miller stated that he has been riding the buses for a long time and is excited to be here.

2) Consent Agenda & Required Approvals

1. Minutes (June + August + September)

Chairman Mahler reviewed the topics and asked if there were any questions. He stated each one and noted that the Committee Meeting notes are on their chairs.

3) Board Development: Election of Board Officers

1. Chairman Mahler stated that the Nominating Committee was Dr. Krieg and Ms. Gott. Dr. Krieg stated that according to the By-Laws each office must be voted on separately and secretly. Nominations come from the floor, so he started as a regular Board Member, by nominating Mr. Mahler who has accepted to serve as Chairman for the next year. Dr. Krieg stated that if a vote is unanimous they can elect each person by acclamation. Chairman Mahler was voted in unanimously. The second open office was Secretary. Ms. Sims was nominated and accepted. There were no other candidates, so it was proposed the vote be by acclamation. It was unanimous. The third vote was for Treasurer. Mr. Cooper accepted the nomination by Dr. Krieg. The vote was a unanimous “yes”.

4) Policy Monitoring and Development

1. Board’s Annual Plan of Work Item
  - a. Draft Calendar + Board Plan of Work  
Chairman Mahler is working on a draft for review, to set priorities with input to hopefully adopt and set forward as a plan for the next Fiscal Year. He brought up various topics for thought including resource allocation, Board Education, new mobility. This was meant to generate discussion tonight. He requested ideas. There was a discussion including resource allocation and technology. Chairman Mahler noted that the content will drive the schedule and the Board will discuss priorities but not set process. Regarding resource allocation, Chairman Mahler noted that staff capabilities of Innovation and Planning must be taken into account. There was more discussion. Chairman Mahler requested they get back to him and Mr. Carpenter with any ideas.
2. Governance Committee  
Chairman Mahler reported that the main focus was the CEO Evaluation which went well. He also noted that a temporary secretary was needed for tonight’s meeting and Ms. Sims agreed to do it.
3. Finance Committee  
Mr. Cooper reported that 3 primary issues were discussed: the calendar that was just discussed, the update to the Strategic Business Plan and the Budget.
4. Service Committee  
Mr. Hewitt reported that Ms. Mozak-Betts was welcomed and discussed were the Annual Plan of Work, updates to the Strategic Business Plan and feedback on the Budget.
5. Other Board Reports & Ownership Linkages
  1. LAC, WATS, A2 Transportation Commission  
Local Advisory Council: Kathleen Mozak-Betts couldn’t technically present the Report but did so in lieu of another representative. Her resignation and 3 open positions were discussed.

Washentaw Area Transportation Study: Dr. Krieg reported that a lot went on and gave details on several topics including Ann Arbor working on ordinances for motorized scooters, joint service with Wayne County and that very ambitious goals were expressed.

A2 Transportation Commission

Ms. Sims reported that the discussion included scooters with regard to U of M and there was an update on BikeShare.

## 5) Strategy and Operational Updates: CEO

### 1. Strategic Business Plan Update

Mr. Carpenter stated that he and Mr. Metzinger will start the decision-making parts of the meeting today. He gave the history of the Strategic Business Plan and noted that the document had reached a maturation point and is finalized for now but that there will be annual updates and the staff will take its direction from the Board on implementation. All the feedback was appreciated which has put a mechanism in place for the Board to establish priorities. He was happy to answer questions. There were some comments and some questions.

### 2. Monitoring Report 2.4: Financial Planning/Budgeting (Acceptance)

Mr. Metzinger stated that the Budget would be presented in 2 steps. First, to determine if it has met the expectations set by the Board. Second, if it has, the Budget would be adopted. There was extensive discussion of details of the Budget including what we are in compliance with, what constitutes a reserve. Mr. Carpenter requested the Board's clarification on providing evidence of compliance to the Board on Policy 2.4.5. What level of detail are they seeking? It was suggested that Rose Mercier might be engaged to assist with this. Discussion of the efficiencies of a Budget followed. It was recommended this conversation continue in the Finance Committee.

### 3. 2019 Budget (Discussion and Approval)

Mr. Metzinger presented the Operating and Capital Budgets. He noted the Budget must be adopted by October 1<sup>st</sup> and today he will be presenting the recommended Budget. He gave a history of the process leading up to this point. This Budget contains no deficits, as required by State Law. He noted that it has been determined that this Budget meets the expectations of the Board, so he presented a Resolution for the Board to adopt it. There was more discussion of various parts of the Budget then, Chairman Mahler asked if they were ready to vote. They were, and the Resolution to adopt the Budget was passed unanimously.

### 4. CEO Report

Mr. Carpenter stated that this was a supplement to the written report. There were many comments about the YTC and emerging technology. Bikeshare is being phased back onto campus at U of M. Next week we have the Triennial Review by the FTA. More findings are expected based upon what he has heard from other transit agencies. There was a question about an AirRide stop in Ypsilanti but there have been no conversations about that while working through the airport logistics. We are waiting to hear back about discretionary grants

we have applied for and he has been elected Vice President of the Board of the MPTA.

6) Emergent Business

Chairman Mahler noted that Resolution 11, CEO Compensation, has been presented. He asked if anyone wanted to discuss it. They did not. Mr. Hewitt made a motion to vote on it and Ms. Sims seconded it. Mr. Cooper reminded the Board of the successful organization that has been built with substantial change and a wonderful victory at the polls. The vote passed unanimously.

6) Closing Items

1. Topics for Next Meeting: Annual Plan of Work, discussion of a retreat, Board Education.
2. Public Comment  
There was none.
3. Board Assessment of Meeting  
Mr. Cooper noted there was a healthy discussion this evening and there have been great strides in moving forward. Mr. Gururaja asked Mr. Carpenter if he had a response to the treatment of the public that was brought up by a member of the public at the beginning of this meeting. Chairman Mahler suggested putting it on the agenda for the next meeting. Mr. Carpenter noted that Section 2.10 in the Policy Manual on External Relationships might be similar and asked if the Board thought there was room for a policy in this area. Chairman Mahler suggested putting it on the agenda for next month's meeting. Dr. Krieg suggested this be discussed in the Service Committee. Chairman Mahler suggested it be circulated to the Board and that Mr. Hewitt put it on the Service Committee Agenda.
4. Chairman Mahler adjourned the meeting at 8:35 p.m.
5. Adjournment  
Dr. Krieg moved to adjourn with support from Ms. Sims. The motion carried, and the meeting adjourned at 9:00 p.m. by unanimous vote.

Respectfully submitted by  
Geri Barnstable

## Issue Brief: Updated Schedule for Monitoring Reports

Meeting: Board

Date: October 18, 2018

Agenda Item # 2.2

### Recommended Committee Action(s):

- By motion, approve updates to Appendix A of the Board Policy Manual.

### Prior Relevant Board Actions and Policies:

- The schedule of monitoring reports was previously updated in September 2017.

### Issue Summary:

The CEO is requesting that the Board approve a change to the schedule for Monitoring Reports, outlined in Appendix A of the Board's Policy Manual. All Monitoring Reports are still present. No other part of the Monitoring process is being changed.

### Background:

Based on the first years' experience with submitting Monitoring Reports, the CEO believes changes to the schedule will improve the coordination with other calendar elements as well as workload for staff. Key changes include:

- Reversing sequence of sub policies and main policies. For example, reporting on policy 2.0 will come *after* 2.1-2.11. This will allow conclusions from the sub-policies to inform conclusions on the main policies.
- The most labor-intensive Monitoring Reports are spread out and better coordinated with other reports to improve workloads for staff.
- Better coordination with fiscal year events and budget approval.

### Impacts of Recommended Action(s):

- **Budgetary/Fiscal:** NA
- **Social:** NA
- **Environmental:** NA
- **Governance:** Monitoring Reports are the chief means of accountability for policies compliance. The schedule in appendix A can only be changed by the Board.

**Attachment:** – Updated Appendix A: Monitoring and Information Report Schedules

Author: MC

Approved by: MC

**Appendix A: Monitoring and Informational Report Schedules**

<b>Policy</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>Method</b>	<b>Freq</b>	<b>Due</b>	<b>Assess</b>	<b>Body</b>
1.0	Ends	Internal	Annual	Nov	Dec	Board
2.0	Global Executive Limitation	Internal	Annual	Sept	Oct	Service/Bd
2.1	Treatment of Riders	Internal	Annual	Dec	Jan	Service/Bd
2.2	Treatment of Staff	Internal	Annual	Oct	Nov	Service/Bd
2.3	Compensation & Benefits	Internal	Annual	Feb	Mar	Finance/Bd
2.4	Financial Planning/Budgeting	Internal	Annual	Aug	Sep	Board
2.5	Financial Condition & Activities	External	Annual	Jan	Feb	Finance/Bd
2.6	Investments	Internal	Annual	Mar	Apr	Finance/Bd
2.7	Ends Focus of Contracts	Internal	Annual	Nov	Dec	Service/Bd
2.8	Asset Protection	Internal	Annual	Feb	Mar	Finance/Bd
2.9	Emergency Succession	Internal	Annual	May	June	Service/Bd
2.10	External Relations	Internal	Annual	May	June	Service/Bd
2.11	Communication & Support	Internal	Annual	Mar	Apr	Board
3.0	Global Governance Process	Direct Inspection	Annual		Sept	Gov/Bd
3.1	Governing Style	Direct Inspection	Annual		Apr	Gov/Bd
3.2	Board Job Description	Direct Inspection	Annual		Mar	Gov/Bd
3.3	Board Member's Code of Conduct	Direct Inspection	Annual		Oct	Gov/Bd
3.4	Agenda Planning	Direct Inspection	Annual		Feb	Gov/Bd
3.5	Chair's Role	Direct Inspection	Annual		Aug	Gov/Bd
3.6	Board Committee Principles	Direct Inspection	Annual		May	Gov/Bd
3.7	Board Committee Structure	Direct Inspection	Annual		May	Gov/Bd
3.8	Cost of Governance	Direct Inspection	Annual		June	Gov/Bd
4.0	Global Board-Mgmt Delegation	Direct Inspection	Annual		Sept	Gov/Bd
4.1	Unity of Control	Direct Inspection	Annual		Oct	Gov/Bd
4.2	Accountability of the CEO	Direct Inspection	Annual		Nov	Gov/Bd
4.3	Delegation to the CEO	Direct Inspection	Annual		Dec	Gov/Bd
4.4	Monitoring CEO Performance	Direct Inspection	Annual		Jan	Gov/Bd

**Other informational reports from staff (+ others as needed/requested):**

<b>Informational Report</b>	<b>Freq.</b>	<b>Board Packet month:</b>
Financial Statements	Quarterly	Nov, Feb, May, Sept
Customer Satisfaction and Service Perf.	Quarterly	Oct, Jan, Apr, July
Capital Improvement Projects	Annual + as needed	Nov
CEO Personal Expense Report	Quarterly	Dec, Mar, June, Sept
CEO Compensation comparables	Every 2 years	April of odd years
Notification of execution of budgeted items over \$250K and grants over \$100K	As needed	
Notification of intended changes to non-unionized staff or procurement manuals, benefits/comp.	As needed	

---

## Issue Brief: Board Education - Emerging Mobility Technologies

Meeting: Board

Date: October 18, 2018

Agenda Item # 3.1

### Recommended Committee Action(s):

- Receive for Information. Discuss policy implications.

### Prior Relevant Board Actions and Policies:

- Board Education is a part of policy 3.4: Agenda Planning.

### Issue Summary:

Prof. Jonathan Levine will make a presentation and lead a discussion about emerging mobility technologies.

### Background:

Within the Policy Governance model, the main products of a board are its policies. A board organizes its priorities into an annual agenda. The result of this agenda planning is called an “Annual Plan of Work”. See policies 3.4 Agenda Planning on page 17 of the AAATA Policy Manual for more information.

Part of a board’s annual agenda includes identifying subjects about which it wishes to become better informed. These informational items are labeled “Board Education.” In general, Board Education is intended to help improve board performance and enrich input and deliberation [policy 3.4(b)]. Education topics spur dialogue about the future and can give board members insight into how to improve written policies, with a focus on Ends policies.

John Carver has made the following observations about the purpose of Board Education.

*“You may spend more than half your time learning – not about staff jobs but about issues that will enable you to make informed, visionary, creative decisions largely about Ends. This learning will come from various sources that you will select. Some will be from ownership ... Some of the learning will come from invited experts or other outsiders who have special knowledge or experience... Some of the learning will come from your CEO and staff.”*

- Reinventing your Board, John Carver (2006). Page 228.

When considering the policy implications of education material, the Board can refer to the process in policy 3.1.3.1 to help determine whether an issue is likely an Ends or a Means, and if they Board wishes to change its policies based on any new information.

File Pathway?

**Impacts of Recommended Action(s):**

- **Budgetary/Fiscal: NA**
- **Social: NA**
- **Environmental: NA**
- **Governance:** Board Education is a part of policy 3.4 Agenda Planning.

**Attachments:** Biography of Prof. Jonathan Levine.

---

Author: MC

Approved by: MC

# Jonathan Levine



Professor of Urban and Regional Planning  
[jnthnlvn@umich.edu](mailto:jnthnlvn@umich.edu)

## Teaching Areas:

Transportation and Land Use Planning  
State and Local Land Management  
Research Design

Jonathan Levine's research centers on the potential and rationales for policy reform in transportation and land use. His current work, focusing on the transformation of the transportation and land-use planning paradigm from a mobility to an accessibility basis, includes a number of sponsored projects and a forthcoming book from Cornell University Press jointly with Professors Joe Grengs and Louis Merlin. He is also interested in the design of institutions for emerging transportation systems – which may be based in large measure on self-driving electric vehicles – to serve metropolitan-accessibility goals. He is the author of *Zoned Out: Regulation, Markets, and Choices in Transportation and Metropolitan Land Use* (Resources for the Future 2006), which argued for transportation and land-use policy reform on the basis of expansion of households' effective range of choices rather than proven modification of travel behavior.

Levine's work has been recognized; together with Professor Joe Grengs and their co-authors, he was awarded the 2010 Chester Rapkin Award for best paper in the *Journal of Planning Education and Research*. He was awarded a 2011 residential fellowship at the Rockefeller Foundation center in Bellagio, Italy. In 2001, the Association of Collegiate Schools of Planning and U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development awarded him the Excellence in Urban Policy Scholarship Award, and he received the Best of Association of Collegiate Schools of Planning Award in 1996.

Levine joined the Taubman College of Architecture and Urban Planning as Assistant Professor in 1991. In addition to a Ph.D. in City and Regional Planning from UC Berkeley, he holds the Master of City Planning and the Master of Science in Engineering, with a civil engineering/transportation focus. He teaches in the areas of transportation, land use, economics of planning, and research design.

## Item Brief: Annual Plan of Work and Education Items

Meeting: Committee

Date: October 18, 2018

Agenda Item # 4.1.1

### Recommended Committee Action(s):

- Discussion additional suggestions for Annual Plan of Work and Board Education Items.

### Issue Summary:

The Chair has asked Board members to suggest items for potential inclusion in the Annual Plan of Work (the Board's priorities) and for general Board Education. Identifying such items is part of the Board self-imposed job duties (policy 3.4).

### Background:

The Annual Plan of Work and Education items are parts of the Policy Governance system. They help the Board to focus on area for potential policy writing. Several ideas have already been identified below:

#### ***Items already suggested for Annual Plan of Work:***

- *Ownership Linkage (Task Force)*
- *Board member orientation, training (Task Force)*
- *Resource Allocation (Task Force)*
- *Review Bylaws, Articles or Incorporation, role of Officers.*
- *Clarify role of Local Advisory Committee (LAC)*
- *Ridership and Coverage*

#### ***Items already suggested for Board Education***

- *Techniques for Ownership Linkage*
- *Transit-supportive land development*
- *Transit's role in community affordability*
- *Transit funding sources and how they work*
- *New Mobility and emerging technology options*
- *Asset Management and deferred maintenance needs*

**Impacts of Recommended Action(s):** here's how this item affects these areas of sustainability

- **Budgetary/Fiscal:** NA
- **Social:** NA
- **Environmental:** NA
- **Governance:** Creating an Annual Plan of Work and Education plan is part of the Board's job duties

**Attachments:** none

---

Author: MC

Reviewed by: MC

Approved by: MC

File Pathway?

## Meeting Summary

Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors

Finance Committee

Tuesday, October 9, 2018

Present: Mike Allemang (Chair), Eli Cooper (phone), Kyra Sims, Jesse Miller

Staff: Matt Carpenter, John Metzinger, Bryan Smith, Phil Webb, Gretchen Johnson, Geri Barnstable

The meeting was called to order at 3:06 p.m. by Chairman Allemang.

### 1) Opening Items

#### a. Agenda (Additions, Approval)

The Committee approved the agenda by consensus. Mr. Carpenter welcomed a special guest, Matt Webb, the Chief Operating Officer of the Regional Transit Authority of Southeast Michigan (RTA). Chairman Allemang officially welcomed new Board Member, Jesse Miller, to the Committee and told him to ask any questions he may have.

#### b. Communications

Mr. Carpenter reported that he and Mr. Metzinger met with Mr. Webb prior to this meeting, where he explained his new role with the RTA which he joined in April. Mr. Webb spoke about putting a series of planning policies in place and meeting with all partners about how the RTA can bring better resources to the table. Mr. Cooper noted that he is glad this is being looked at because explosive growth is expected in Ann Arbor. Mr. Webb then left the meeting.

### 2) Policy Monitoring and Development

#### a. Consider Budget Policies

Mr. Metzinger directed attention to the Issue Brief and attachments. Last month, the Board looked at the Monitoring Report and discussed Policy 2.4.5 and suggested revisions by staff. Chairman Allemang stated that he would like to review Policy 2.4.5 first which could be made very specific while it's too general as it is. Since it is covered in other limitations, and is part of the budgeting process, he would be in favor of deleting it. Ms. Sims stated she doesn't believe

it adds anything, so she is in favor of deleting it. She does believe it is covered elsewhere. Mr. Cooper also recommended it be deleted. Chairman Allemang stated that at the Board Meeting they asked the Finance Committee to make the determination and the Committee recommends deletion.

Mr. Metzinger next discussed a suggested change to Policy 2.5.6 to lower the CEO's authorization limitation for contracts not already approved in the budget. Mr. Carpenter suggested it not be necessary for routine, monthly contracts to require Board authorization. The Mobility Challenge Grant just came up, so Mr. Carpenter would like to defer this approval decision because the grant only came in this morning. Mr. Cooper noted that this is one instance in many months, so it may not be necessary to use it as the guideline for the approval amount. Mr. Carpenter noted that informing the Board on large amounts makes the CEO and the staff accountable. There was some further discussion. Chairman Allemang determined they should return to this topic next month.

Mr. Metzinger reported that 2.5.10 brings up a similar issue regarding the Board's deciding if debt should be taken on. Mr. Carpenter stated that this would be a Board decision. There was a discussion of debt. Frequency of auditors was also discussed with 6 years being considered the best. The Finance Committee will review suggested changes to policy again next month.

b. Annual Plan of Work

Mr. Carpenter reported that Chairman Mahler would like the Board to establish priorities on this and Board Education. Chairman Allemang noted that he and Ms. Sims are part of the Ownership Linkage Task Force and could use some help from Rose Mercier. Mr. Miller was also invited to join this Task Force. The date of November 8<sup>th</sup> will be a target date to work with Ms. Mercier.

c. Education Suggestions

Chairman Allemang suggested combining Emerging Mobility Technology with New Mobility and emerging technologies. Ms. Sims wanted to prioritize Ownership Linkage. Chairman Allemang noted the by-laws and articles of incorporation are out of date but the cities, not the Board, adopt the articles. Chairman Allemang recommended introducing the new law firm to the Board. Mr. Carpenter reported that the law firm is Dykema which is a national practice, established in Michigan and that the leading attorney, Mel Muskovitz, is well known. The Executive Team will be meeting with that team on Friday. He also reported that we have begun using the new firm. Mr. Carpenter will arrange for an introduction to the Board.

3) Strategy and Operational Updates

a. Y-Lot

The Y-Lot was discussed.

4) Closing Items

- a. Topics for Next Meeting: It will be Election Day; 4<sup>th</sup> Quarter Financial Results for FY 2018 and the Preliminary Year End Report; Issue Brief on Investments; talk through FTA Triennial Review findings; appointment of an Audit Task Force.
- b. Adjournment

Chairman Allemang adjourned the meeting at 4:25 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted,  
Geri Barnstable

Meeting Summary  
Ann Arbor Area Transportation Authority Board of Directors  
Service Committee  
Wednesday, October 10, 2018

Present: Roger Hewitt (Chair), Kathleen Mozak-Betts

Staff: Matt Carpenter, Bryan Smith, John Metzinger, Gretchen Johnson, Geri Barnstable

The meeting was called to order at 9:05 a.m. by Chairman Hewitt.

1) Opening Items

a. Agenda (Additions, Approval)

The Committee approved the agenda by consensus.

b. Communications

Mr. Carpenter introduced Gretchen Johnson, our Interim Deputy CEO of Innovation and Planning

2) Policy Monitoring and Development

a. Consider Citizen Suggestion for "Treatment of Travelling Public"

Chairman Hewitt reported on the speaker at the last Board Meeting, Mr. Clark, who spoke about the treatment of cyclist. It was since learned that the incident was a year ago, but we could have responded better. Attached are his suggestions for a new policy. Staff has been asked to look into it and come up with suggestions. Ms. Mozak-Betts was surprised to see nothing in the Policy Manual about how drivers interact with others on the road. Mr. Smith noted that we do cover local laws in training, stressing safety first. Chairman Hewitt noted that while training drivers is not a Board concern, they should be operating lawfully. A discussion ensued on handing of complaints and safe driving and it was agreed that Mr. Clark's idea was not unreasonable.

b. Annual Plan of Work Suggestions

Mr. Carpenter reported that Chairman Mahler would like the Board to set priorities for the Annual Plan of Work. The Finance Committee has begun to do so. Chairman Hewitt suggested the Chairman of each Task Force take the lead. Chairman Hewitt asked what data we have on where trends are going in transportation and which we should think strategically about regarding the social impact. Mr. Carpenter recommended not dwelling on things that could change next week but on what trends are going on and how it could affect us now or in the future in particular; new mobility, autonomous vehicles leading to layoffs. Do these guide the organization's policies? Ms. Mozak-Betts asked how the Annual Plan of Work is implemented specifically with regard to the LAC. Mr.

Carpenter explained that the Chairman and the Committees determine this, and that Chairman Mahler has wanted to address the role of the LAC.

c. Education Suggestions

Mr. Carpenter reported that the Governance Committee discussed looking for appropriate experts on the topics discussed and he is trying to line some up to present at meetings. There was further discussion of the impact of Uber and autonomous vehicles. Chairman Hewitt warned that the Board shouldn't get bogged down in too many of the latest technology details. It was also clarified that new mobility does not mean accessibility for those with disabilities. He reiterated that the Board could educate itself on trends that could affect us now or in the future. Mr. Smith suggested that pilots they have done about emerging technical solutions could also be shared with the Board.

d. Monitoring Report Schedule

Mr. Carpenter had no changes or comments. He reported that people seem generally happy with it.

3) Strategy and Operational Updates: CEO

a. Y-Lot Update

The Y-Lot was discussed.

4) Closing Items

a. Topics for Next Meeting

1. Quarterly Service Report, Monitoring Report, Treatment of Staff.

b. Adjournment

Chairman Hewitt adjourned the meeting at 10:32 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,  
Geri Barnstable

## Issue Brief: Changes to Policy 2.1: Treatment of Riders

Meeting: Board

Date: 10/18/18

Agenda Item #2.3a

### Recommended Committee Action(s):

- Receive for information and discuss possible changes to Board Policy 2.1: Treatment of Riders.

### Issue Summary:

At the September Board meeting a member of the public raised concerns with conflicts between buses and bicyclists, as well as with TheRide’s responses to public inquiries. The speaker was familiar with Policy Governance and submitted suggested language for a new Executive Limitation policy (Attachment 1). The Full Board has asked the Service Committee to review the suggestion and provide a recommendation. The Service Committee reviewed the matter and is making a recommendation to the full Board.

Following a discussion much like that suggested in policies 3.1.3.1, the Service Committee agreed that there were no policies addressing treatment of other road users (such a cyclists), but that perhaps there should be additional Executive Limitations in this area. The Committee also asked staff to prepare alternative options for addressing many of the same issues raised by the citizen. In response, staff suggested edits to policy 2.1: Treatment of Riders, found in Attachment 2. The Committee discussed the two policy text options and are recommending that the full Board consider amending Policy 2.1 based on the edits suggested by staff in Attachment 2, below.

### Background

In the current policy manual, only “riders and potential riders” are specifically referenced in the Executive Limitations.

### Impacts of Recommended Action(s):

- **Budgetary/Fiscal:** No impact.
- **Social:** New language will publicly commit the agency to a reasonable standard and show responsiveness to public input to the Board.
- **Governance:** New language is an important step in refining the use of Policy Governance and institutional organization and effectiveness.

**Attachment 1:** Resident-Suggested policy text

**Attachment 2:** Alternate Policy Edits for Consideration

---

Author: BDS

Reviewed by: MC

Approved by: MC

Date: 10/12/18

## **Attachment 1: Resident-Suggested Policy Text**

### 2.12 Treatment of Traveling Public

With respect to interactions with operators of other vehicles and people utilizing non-motorized transportation, the CEO shall not cause, allow, or fail to address conditions, procedures, or decisions that might result in illegal, unsafe, unprofessional, or discourteous operation of vehicles in the AAATA fleet.

Further, without limiting the scope of the foregoing by this enumeration, the CEO shall not:

2.12.1 Operate without ensuring that AAATA drivers are trained in state and local laws and court rulings in effect in the jurisdictions in which they will be operating.

2.12.2 Discourage persons from asking questions, airing complaints, or being heard, or allow correspondence to be overlooked or not resolved in a timely and reasonable manner.

2.12.2.1 Allow concerns about how AAATA deals with correspondence to not be presented to the Board in a timely manner.

2.12.3 Operate without ensuring that AAATA vehicle operators exhibit safe, professional, and courteous conduct that reflects well upon the AAATA in public perception.

## Attachment 2: Alternate Policy Edits for Consideration

By modifying the Policy 2.1: Treatment of Riders, it may be possible to address the resident's concerns in a more concise manner. Suggested edits are in red italics of the existing policy text below. These edits were provided only for the Board's consideration. Staff also noted that other policies already cover issues of training (2.2) and lawfulness and prudence (2.0).

### 2.1 TREATMENT OF RIDERS *THE TRAVELING PUBLIC*

With respect to *the agency's* interactions with riders, ~~and~~ potential riders, *other road users, and the general public* the CEO shall not cause, allow or fail to address conditions, procedures, or decisions that are unprofessional, *unlawful*, unsafe, undignified, disrespectful, unclear, or overly intrusive.

Further, without limiting the scope of the foregoing by this enumeration, the CEO shall not:

2.1.1 Provide facilities, vehicles, or services that are not reasonably accessible to potential riders regardless of mobility limitations.

2.1.2 Allow anyone, including people who have disabilities or seniors to be discriminated against with respect to the AAATA's services.

2.1.3 Operate without providing effective, comprehensible, accessible, and timely information.

*2.1.3.1 Fail to respond to questions or complaints in a timely and reasonable manner.*

2.1.4 Discourage persons from asking questions, airing a complaint, or being heard.

2.1.5 Operate without established and enforceable standards for customer service and ~~rider~~ *the safety of the public*.

2.1.5.1 Fail to communicate standards and expectations to the public and riders.

2.1.6 Use methods of collecting, reviewing, transmitting, or storing personal information that allows improper access or inappropriate disclosure

2.1.6.1 Use forms that elicit personal information for which there is no clear necessity.




---

## CEO's Report

Board Meeting Date: October 18, 2018

Agenda Item #4.1

### Operational and Project Updates:

**BikeShare** - We have announced the selection of Shift Transit as the new operator of ArborBike. Shift Transit is a full-scale operator of bike share systems, currently operating in Detroit, Toronto, Tucson, and Chattanooga. Shift Transit operates 475 stations and 4,850 bicycles across North America where members took over 1.6 million trips in 2017 and are quickly approaching 2 million trips in 2018. Staff has been coordinating with the University of Michigan and City of Ann Arbor to prevent re-launch issues, with an eye towards possibly relaunching this fall on the University Campus. More relaunch details will be available in the next 30 days.

**Federal Transit Administration Review** – Transit agencies like TheRide are visited every three years by the Federal Transit Administration (FTA). The FTA conducts a routine review of agency records to determine how compliant the agency has been with federal laws and regulations. FTA auditors were on-site and completed their review the week of September 24th. A preliminary report is expected shortly.

**Operations Notes** - Terry Black has retired as the Manager of Fleet Services. We have hired Tom Borowski as a consultant to be the interim Manager of Fleet Services while we conduct a nationwide search for a permanent replacement. Tom was a Fleet Supervisor for us for over a decade and retired five months ago. The position has been advertised, and the application period is closed. We have 58 applicants for the position from across the country. Many have years of experience in leading people, and we should be able to select a viable candidate from the pool.

Transportation held the 2018 Roadeo, and Reginald Trussell won for the second year in a row. He will be going to Louisville KY for next year's APTA Bus and Paratransit conference. In case you didn't know, we hold the Roadeo in the fall every year in partnership with the U of M transit department. We use one of their parking lots, and in trade for the space, AAATA provides lunch for both AAATA'ers and the UM crowd. A fun time was had by all!

**RTA**– Mr. Ned Stabler was elected by the Washtenaw County Board of Commissioners to be the next Washtenaw County board member of the RTA. He will fill out the remainder of Liz Gerber's term.

**Grants** – Recently, TheRide has won a grant from the Michigan Mobility Challenge and will soon be testing new autonomous wheelchair securement systems in larger buses. Unfortunately, TheRide's application to the FTA for facility rehabilitation funds was not accepted. Staff will be following up with the FTA to try and learn how to be more competitive in the future.

**AirRide** – Two new large shelters have been installed on 5<sup>th</sup> Ave near the Blake Transit Center for AirRide passengers. This infrastructure will provide shelter from the elements for AirRide passengers and their luggage. TheRide appreciates the support we've received from the Downtown Development Authority to make these improvements. See picture below.

